

# MINUTES

## Valdosta Historic Preservation Commission

Valdosta City Hall Annex Multi-Purpose Room  
300 North Lee Street, Valdosta, Georgia

October 4, 2021 5:30 p.m.

### MEMBERS PRESENT

Dr. Alex Alvarez  
Mr. Tommy Crane  
Ms. Sally Querin

Dr. Harry Hamm  
Ms. Celine Gladwin  
Ms. Laura Yale

### MEMBERS ABSENT

Ms. Sandie Burkett

### STAFF PRESENT

Mr. Jeff Brammer  
Ms. Lauren Hurley

### VISITORS PRESENT

Rita Hightower  
Cathy Perry  
Robert Crane  
Kristin Hanna  
Clay Shill

### I. Call to Order and Determination of Quorum

The meeting was called to order at 5:31 p.m. by Chairman Alvarez. It was determined that a quorum of members was present. Chairman Alvarez thanked everyone for coming and reminded audience members to please sign the attendance register.

### II. Review and Approval of Minutes

The September 13, 2021, draft minutes were reviewed by the Board. Dr. Hamm made a motion to approve the minutes. Mr. Crane seconded the motion, and it was called and carried unanimously (6-0 vote).

### III. Consideration of Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) Applications

#### **A. HPC-2021-81: 904 North Patterson Street:**

Jeff Brammer presented the staff report for the case. He stated that the petitioner has asked to replace the door and windows in the chapel behind the Crescent. The Crescent is located at 904 N. Patterson Street. The neoclassical structure was constructed circa 1898 and is a contributing property in the local historic district, subarea 1. It is zoned R-6 (single family residential). The property consists of a three-story house. Efforts to save the Crescent in the 1950s helped lead to Historic Preservation in Valdosta. It was listed on the National Historic Register in 1980 and is a rare example of neoclassical architecture in Georgia. The main residence is not the only historic building on the property. Other important aspects of the property include the gardens, the chapel, a reception hall, and a schoolhouse. The washhouse-turned-chapel is the focus of discussion. It is the only original outbuilding remaining on the property. The carriage house and smokehouse have been removed. The chapel is a small wooden one-story gabled structure built circa 1905. It was moved to its current location in 1979 and had a steeple added. At that time, the windows, doors, and roof were replaced. Pictures and articles from late 1970s media reports provided documentation for the updates. The chapel consists of a pier foundation, board siding, and shingle roof. The windows are 6 over 9 double hung sash windows. The proposed project is to make in-kind repairs to the fascia, soffit, and siding of the chapel, reception hall, and schoolhouse; to replace coupled front doors on the chapel with pine, 6-panel exterior grade doors; and to replace two, 6 over 9 wood-framed windows on the chapel side elevations. These windows will be 6 over 9 primed wood windows with PVC brickmould jambs, wood stiles and rails, and profiled composite muntins/mullions (grids). Mr. Brammer showed examples of where the in-kind repairs will be made on the soffit and siding of the chapel and examples of the replacement windows and door. Staff's recommendations are to approve the in-kind material repairs and replacement of wood fascia, soffit, and siding on the rear outbuildings on the reception hall,

chapel and schoolhouse; to approve in-kind replacement of two, wood exterior doors on the chapel façade; and to disapprove of the replacement of two, wood-framed 6 over 9 double-hung windows with 6 over 9 wood primed windows, featuring PVC brickmould jambs, wood stiles and rails, and profiled composite muntins recommending in-kind replacements instead. This recommendation is made because it is the only original outbuilding on the property and the Crescent and its features are of historic importance to Valdosta's heritage and local preservation.

Dr. Alvarez asked that the applicant or the applicant's representation speak in support of the application. Rita Hightower approached the lectern. She stated that she has been with the Crescent for over 12 years. Ms. Hightower stated that the damage has mainly been caused by squirrels and moisture. She stated that COVID hit the Crescent really hard and that they are trying to recuperate and raise funds to keep it open and viable. The windows that are requested were the only windows available and it took 3 months to receive them. The windows are the most important portion of the request because there is such damage to the existing windows. They must be replaced so that more damage is not caused and to provide security. She stated that procuring windows that are similar to the original windows is something that they would like to do, but money and safety, at this point, prevented them from getting them. The windows that they have cost \$2,500. The Crescent has to raise money to do these projects so that is why they went this route for the windows. With no one else in favor or opposition of the application, Dr. Alvarez turned it back to the commission for discussion. Mr. Crane stated that he would like to recuse himself of the discussion because he is a member of the club. Dr. Hamm asked what the difference in appearance would be with the PVC windows versus the wooden windows. Mr. Brammer stated that they look very similar and that laymen would probably not be able to tell a difference. Ms. Gladwin stated that it says that the frame is wooden and wanted confirmation on that. Mr. Brammer stated that the frame is not wooden but that the stiles and rails are wooden, and the muntins are a profiled composite. Dr. Hamm stated that he thinks that the last thing that someone would notice are the windows because they appear insignificant but that they are significant to the Crescent to be able to save the building. Ms. Querin asked Mr. Crane if he was consulted before the windows were purchased. Mr. Crane said that he was not consulted. Ms. Gladwin stated that she knows that in the architectural industry that supplies are in high demand and that some of her projects have had a wait time of 39 weeks for windows and other supplies to arrive. She stated that the applicant found a replacement window that is very close to the current window and considering the stewardship that the Crescent has exhibited, the priority is saving the building. Ms. Yale asked if the windows were from 1905 or from the 1970s. Mr. Brammer confirmed that the windows are from the 1970s. Dr. Hamm motioned to approve the application as submitted. Ms. Yale seconded the motion. The vote was unanimous (5-0 vote).

**B. HPC-2021-85: 1610 Williams Street:**

Mr. Brammer presented the staff report on the case. The petitioner has requested to add an open-air porch on the side of the residence. The property is located at 1610 Williams Street. It is a Craftsman-styled home built circa 1925 located in the Brookwood North National Register District. It is a contributing resource located in Subarea 1 and zoned R-10 (single family residential). The house is a stucco house on concrete foundation with a hipped roof and asphalt shingles. The rear features an elevated Craftsman-styled porch which came before HPC in 2019. The north elevation shows the location of the project where there is currently a porch with a non-historic awning and concrete floor. It is tucked back from the right of way with the driveway leading to a detached garage which was added in the early 1990s. Mr. Brammer exhibited photos of the neighboring properties to orient the commission members. The project is to remove the non-historic canvas awning and metal columns on the north elevation and to construct a new attached Craftsman-style porch. Dimensions and specifics of the porch are to be 7 feet by 18 feet open-air porch with concrete patio floor, ground-level stucco piers/wall, and 4 battered wooden columns supporting a half-hip roof with asphalt shingles. The petitioner provided elevation drawings which each commissioner has in their packets. Staff recommends approval for the project as submitted.

Dr. Alvarez asked if the applicant or the applicant's representation would like to speak in support of the application. Robert Crane, owner and resident at 1610 Williams Street, approached the lectern. He stated that the existing awning is in pretty bad shape and in an attempt to construct a replacement

porch for the side of the house, the design is drafted to complement the Craftsman-styled structure. The addition will be an example of restoring characteristics of a Craftsman home and lead by example. Ms. Querin complimented the homeowner on a great job with the presentation and drawings submitted. With no one else in support or opposition of the case, Dr. Alvarez opened the discussion for the commission members. Ms. Gladwin stated that it looks great. Mr. Crane made a motion to approve the request as submitted. Ms. Querin seconded the motion. The vote was unanimous (6-0 vote).

**C. HPC-2021-86: 215 West North Street:**

Mr. Brammer presented the staff report for the case. The petitioner has requested to construct an open-air pavilion adjacent to the main commercial building. The property is a commercial institutional complex located in the local Historic District. It is a non-contributing resource in subarea 2, zoned R-P (Residential Professional). The property has a brick exterior with a galvanized metal roof and fencing around the perimeter. The rear of the property has an outdoor swimming pool, football field, and playground area. The location of the pavilion is next to the playground area and parking lot. The proposed project is to add a 20-foot by 30-foot open air, covered pavilion/gazebo accessory structure to the rear of the property with a concrete slab floor, pressure-treated wooden frame, and 29-gauge metal panel roof. Mr. Brammer presented drawings provided by the contractor of the proposed structure and placement of the structure. Staff recommends approval of the addition and placement of the new accessory structure as proposed.

Dr. Alvarez asked if the petitioner or petitioner's representation would like to speak in support of the application. Clay Shill from Cauthorn Construction Company approached the lectern. He stated that Cauthorn Construction was approached by the Boys & Girls Club three weeks ago after they received a grant from Lowe's for \$25,000 to build the pavilion. The catch is it must be built by October 31<sup>st</sup>. Basically, it will consist of 2-by-4 treated lumber with the gallery blue roof matching the existing roof on the main building. It will have electrical work as well because they will utilize the space for outdoor teaching. Dr. Hamm asked if it would be screened or fenced in. Mr. Shill stated that it is in a fenced in area. Ms. Querin added that the plans say purposed fans. She asked if the fans were going to be installed. Mr. Shill said that the Boys & Girls Club is going to add the fans later but that they will place electrical boxes so that they may be installed later. She asked if the grant covered the cost of the fans. Mr. Shill said that the pavilion alone prices out at around \$37,000 and that they are donating some of the labor and materials. They anticipate that it costs around \$12,000 more than the grant. Kristin Hannah, the Vice President of Marketing and Development at the Boys & Girls Club, approached the lectern. She stated that they are proud to be in the Historic District and the building is going to continue to add value to the area and allows them to serve at a higher quality with the addition of the pavilion. Ms. Yale made a motion to approve the addition as requested. Ms. Gladwin seconded the motion. The vote was unanimous (6-0 vote).

**IV. Consideration of Administrative Review and Approvals**

Board members reviewed the Administrative Reviews for the month of September with no questions.

**V. Other Business**

**(A) Local Historic District Survey Update (Phase II)** – Mr. Brammer stated that the contract has been signed with JMT and they expect to get started this month. Mr. Brammer will be in communication with them and will provide the commission members with updates. In speaking with the state representative, Mr. Brammer stated that it appears that Valdosta is far ahead of the other municipalities that were awarded grants.

**(B) Future Survey Plans (Phase III)** – Mr. Brammer informed the commissioners that at City Council there have been people who have come forward to speak about Phase 1, 2, and 3. There are some very vocal interests from people on the South side to be included in Phase 3 to get the places that are in the Southside National Register District included in the Local Historic District. Ms. Gladwin stated that the paper presented it that Phase 3 will focus on Southside. Mr. Brammer stated that a young woman got up to ask if the City Council is in favor and will back up the mayor's comments two nights before at the work

session to support a Phase 3 additional survey with the Southside National Register District as the target. City Council stated that they would support that. Mr. Brammer is not sure if City Council is aware of all the processes that must be done in order to do that. It looks as if City Council is in favor of doing that. It would not be able to be initiated until Phase 2 is completed because receiving more grant money for a project before the previous project is complete is unlikely. Ms. Gladwin suggested holding a work session because HPC is required to have multiple work sessions a year and the commission needs to discuss aligning the Local Historic District with the National Register Districts. She stated that if residents are part of the Local Historic District but not part of a National Register District, they are not getting the benefits but are held to local enforcements. For residents to take advantage of financial incentives, they have to be part of a National Register District. She suggested doing a work session to align the two districts to help guide how the commission moves forward. There is a lot to discuss regarding this and much education at a community level to get the process for the short-term and long-term goals to be determined. Dr. Hamm asked if there were 100 people at City Council to speak about the third phase or 3 people. Mr. Brammer stated that one person spoke and was accompanied by one other lady who then spoke one on one with Mr. Brammer and Matt Martin after the meeting. Dr. Hamm stated that there must be a lot of education in the community for people to commit to all of this and what it means for them and how their hands are going to be tied because they do not know what it means. He stated that he bets the majority of the residents do not know what it is being done for. Mr. Brammer reiterated Dr. Hamm's statement by saying that he is sure that there are people who do not want this because of the restrictions. Ms. Gladwin said that the most advantageous route would be for residences to be included in the National Register Districts. She reiterated that the education must happen so that people can make well-informed decisions based on what is available to them, and that should be the focus of the next work session. Ms. Querin also suggested that HPC involves Al Willis in the discussion because he has been very involved with the heritage group, and he is full of knowledge about the history of Valdosta. Ms. Gladwin stated that the work session is an open public hearing and will be advertised, but that Al Willis would be a great addition to the discussion because of his architectural background and knowledge of history. Ms. Gladwin stated that she would like the work session to be more of a strategic plan for the long-term goals of the survey. Dr. Hamm asked who would be responsible for that. Ms. Gladwin stated that the first step is here at the HPC meeting. She said that any group can start the first step and that it is a long process that goes to DCA. She said that HPC would be the most well-equipped group because of each commission members' expertise. Before a survey can even be done, there needs to be a consensus and demonstrated that more than half of the neighborhood is on board with a long-term plan.

- (C) **Lee Street Downtown Amphitheater and Park** – Mr. Brammer brought plans for the Lee Street Downtown Amphitheater and Park as it is in the Local Historic District to let the commissioners look at what is being constructed. Mr. Brammer stated that he contacted Paige Dukes to ask if she would be able to present to HPC concerning plans for the historic courthouse, but she was unable to come to the meeting and that November would not work for her either. She stated that the December meeting may be when she can attend. Ms. Querin stated that she does not understand why the pressed timber is not being used on the amphitheater instead of steel because our community is so rich in forestry. She said that she brought it up at the City Council meeting. Ms. Gladwin asked why it did not come before HPC. Mr. Brammer stated that city government and their property is exempt from review.

## VI. New Business

- (A) **New Business on the Floor** – Dr. Hamm asked if anyone knew who bought the Greyhound bus station and what is being put there. Dr. Hamm said he stopped by to ask what was to come of the property and the lady there said that it would be a daycare center for adults. He stated that he was unsure if the property was commercial or not, and he would like to know if it is legal and conforming. Staff will check into it.
- Ms. Querin stated that Mike Dover is putting his historic home on the market, and he would want someone who is preservation minded to purchase the home. Ms. Yale stated that there are many websites and apps that cater to the historic house market for individuals who are into historic homes to seek out. She said that she would send Ms. Querin more information to pass on to Mike Dover.

Mr. Crane asked what happened to the item that was tabled from the last meeting with the metal roof in which the applicant did not come to the HPC meeting. Mr. Brammer stated that the applicant withdrew their application after it was tabled and wanted to move forward with in-kind roofing (shingle to shingle).

**VII. Adjournment**

There being no further business, Chairman Alvarez called for a motion to adjourn. Mr. Crane made a motion to adjourn. Ms. Gladwin seconded the motion, and it was called and carried unanimously (6-0 vote). The meeting adjourned at 6:24 pm.

HPC Chairman \_\_\_\_\_



Date \_\_\_\_\_

11-2-21